

Lies

I. Below you will find six brief descriptions of different scenarios. Please read them and answer the two questions after each description; make brief notes.

- (1) Moe has eaten the cake Juliet was intending to serve to company. Juliet asks Moe, 'Did you eat the cake?' Moe says, 'No.' Did Moe lie? Why?
- (2) Dick, John, and Harry are playing golf. Harry steps on Dick's ball. When Dick arrives and sees his ball mashed into the turf, he says, 'John, did you step on my ball?' John replies, 'No. Harry did it.' Did John lie? Why?
- (3) Pigfat believes he has to pass the candy store to get to the pool hall, but he is wrong about because the candy store has moved. Pigfat's mother doesn't approve of pool. As he is going out the door intending to go to the pool hall, his mother asks him where he is going. He says, 'I am going to the candy store.' Did Pigfat lie? Why?
- (4) One morning, Katerina has an arithmetic test she hasn't studied for, and so she doesn't want to go to school. She says to her mother, 'I'm sick.' Her mother takes her temperature, and it turns out to Katerina's surprise that she really is sick, later that day developing the measles. Did Katerina lie? Why?
- (5) Schmallowitz is invited to dinner to his boss's house. After a dismal evening enjoyed by no one, Schmallowitz says to his hostess, 'Thanks, it was a terrific party.' Schmallowitz doesn't believe it was a terrific party and he really isn't trying to convince anyone he had a good time, but is just concerned to say something nice to his boss's wife, regardless of the fact that he doesn't expect her to believe it. Did Schmallowitz lie? Why?
- (6) John and Mary have recently started going together. Valentino is Mary's ex-boyfriend. One evening, John asks Mary, 'Have you seen Valentino this week?' Mary answers, 'Valentino's been sick with mononucleosis for the past two weeks.' Valentino has in fact been sick with mononucleosis for the past two weeks, but it is also the case that Mary had a date with Valentino the night before. Did Mary lie? Why?
- (7) Two patients are waiting to be wheeled into the operating room. The doctor points to one and says, 'Is Jones here the appendectomy or the tonsillectomy?' Nurse Braine has just read the charts. Although she is anxious to keep her job, she has nevertheless confused the charts in her mind and replies, 'The appendectomy,' when in fact poor Jones is the one scheduled for tonsillectomy. Did Nurse Braine lie?

II. How do your responses relate to the definitions of *lie* you formulated earlier in the course? How would you define *lie* now?